

Public

STC Alternative and Workgroup Vote

CM093: Extending the principles of the User Commitment Methodology to Final Sums Methodology as a consequence of CUSC Modification – CMP417

Please note: To participate in any votes, Workgroup members need to have attended at least 50% of meetings.

Stage 1 – Alternative Vote

If Workgroup Alternative Requests have been made, vote on whether they should become Alternative STC Modifications.

Stage 2 – Workgroup Vote

2a) Assess the Original solution and Alternative STC Modifications (if there are any) against the STC objectives compared to the baseline (the current STC).

2b) If Alternative STC Modifications exist, vote on whether each Alternative STC Modification better facilitates the Applicable STC Objectives better than the Original Modification Proposal.

2c) Vote on which of the options is best.

Terms used in this document

Term	Meaning
Baseline	The current STC (if voting for the Baseline, you believe no modification should be made)
Original	The solution which was firstly proposed by the Proposer of the modification

Public

For reference the Applicable STC Objectives are:

- a) *efficient discharge of the obligations imposed upon Transmission Licensees by Transmission Licences and the Electricity Act 1989;*
- b) *efficient discharge of the obligations imposed upon the licensee by the Electricity System Operator licence, the Energy Act 2023 and Electricity Act 1989;*
- c) *development, maintenance, and operation of an efficient, economical, and coordinated system of electricity transmission;*
- d) *facilitating effective competition in the generation and supply of electricity, and (so far as consistent therewith) facilitating such competition in the distribution of electricity;*
- e) *protection of the security and quality of supply and safe operation of the National Electricity Transmission System insofar as it relates to interactions between Transmission Licensees and the licensee*;*
- f) *promotion of good industry practice and efficiency in the implementation and administration of the arrangements described in the STC;*
- g) *facilitation of access to the National Electricity Transmission System for generation not yet connected to the National Electricity Transmission System or Distribution System; and*
- h) *compliance with the Electricity Regulation and any Relevant Legally Binding Decisions of the European Commission and/or the Agency.*

* See Electricity System Operator Licence

Workgroup Vote

Stage 1 – Alternative Vote

No Alternatives were raised for this modification.

Stage 2a – Assessment against objectives

To assess the STC Modification against the STC objectives compared to the baseline (the current STC).

Public

You will also be asked to provide a statement to be added to the Workgroup Report alongside your vote to assist the reader in understanding the rationale for your vote.

ASO = Applicable STC Objective

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Better facilitates ASO (h)	Overall (Y/N)
Gareth Williams – Scottish Power Transmission plc. (SPT)									
Original	-	-	-	Y	-	Y	-	-	Y
Voting Statement: We believe that the original proposal better facilitates the applicable objectives d and f as this will reduce restrictions on new developments and facilitate competition and promote good practice and efficiency by introducing a common approach to liability and security arrangements.									

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Better facilitates ASO (h)	Overall (Y/N)
Matthew Paige-Stimson – National Grid Electricity Transmission (NGET)									
Original	-	-	-	Y	-	Y	-	-	Y
Voting Statement: This modification is straightforward and serves as a minimalistic administrative adjustment designed to facilitate the implementation of CMP417. It accomplishes precisely what is required, nothing more, nothing less.									

Public

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Better facilitates ASO (h)	Overall (Y/N)
Harriet Eckweiler – Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission plc. (SHET)									
Original	-	-	-	Y	-	Y	-	-	Y
<p>Voting Statement:</p> <p>The original proposal better facilitates the applicable objectives than the baseline and supports the implementation of CMP417. The proposal supports the goal of equitable treatment for all users when calculating securities and liabilities.</p>									

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Better facilitates ASO (h)	Overall (Y/N)
Steve Baker – System Operator									
Original	-	-	-	Y	-	Y	-	-	Y
<p>Voting Statement:</p> <p>This modification delivers the minimum required changes to the STC as a consequence of CMP417, enabling extension of some of the principles of CUSC section 15 “User Commitment Methodology” to Users on Final Sums methodology. NESO supports the changes and solution.</p>									

Of the 4 votes, how many voters said this option was better than the Baseline

Option	Number of voters that voted this option as better than the Baseline
Original	4

Public

Stage 2b – Alternative STC Modification Vote (If required)

No Alternatives were raised for this modification.

Stage 2c – Workgroup Vote

Which option is the best? (Baseline or Original Proposal)

Workgroup Member	Company	Industry Sector	BEST Option?	Which objective(s) does the change better facilitate? (if baseline not applicable)
Gareth Williams	Scottish Power Transmission plc. (SPT)	Transmission Owner	original	(d) and (f)
Matthew Paige-Stimson	National Grid Electricity Transmission (NGET)	Transmission Owner	original	(d) and (f)
Neil Bennett	Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission plc. (SHET)	Transmission Owner	original	(d) and (f)
Steve Baker	NESO	System Operator	original	(d) and (f)